

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

CONTENTS



A. Invitations

1. Invitation tracking table
2. Text of invitations or newspaper ads

B. Meeting

1. Program
2. Non-technical summary
3. Participants
 - i. list
 - ii. feedback forms
4. Pictures
5. Outcomes of consultation
 - i. Minutes of the meeting
 - ii. Assessment of comments
 - iii. Revisit sustainable development assessment
 - iv. Summary of alterations based on comments

C. Sustainable development matrix

1. Own sustainable development assessment
2. Outcome blind exercise stakeholders
3. Consolidated sustainable development matrix

D. Preparation of Stakeholder Feedback Round

Annex 1: Participant list

Annex 2: Feedback forms

SECTION A. Invitations

A.1. Invitation tracking table

[See Toolkit 2.6 and Toolkit Annex J]

Category Code	Organisation (if relevant)	Name of invitee	Way of invitation	Date of invitation	Confirmation received? Y/N
A	Muhtar of Kızılören Village	İlyas Albes	Visited and called	21.10.2008	Y
A	Muhtar of Kozluören Village	Veli Yıldırım	Visited and called	21.10.2008	Y
A	Muhtar of Hacizköy Village	Mustafa Işık	Visited and called	21.10.2008	Y
A	Muhtar of Beyçe Village	Hulusi Bildi	Visited and called	21.10.2008	Y
A	Muhtar of Göктаş Village	Sedat Saygılı	Visited and called	21.10.2008	Y
A	Muhtar of Hamidiye Village	Cafer Altıntaş	Visited and called	21.10.2008	Y
A	Muhtar of Gökçukur Village	Recep Çoban	Visited and called	21.10.2008	Y
B	Forestry Management of Soma	General	Invitation faxed and called	31.10.2008	Y
B	Forestry Management of Kırkağaç	General	Invitation faxed and called	31.10.2008	Y
B	Soma Governorship	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Soma Municipality	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Kırkağaç Governorship	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Kırkağaç Municipality	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Manisa Agricultural Management, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Special Provincial Administration of Manisa	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Provincial Directorate of Manisa, Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF)	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y

B	General Directorate of Environmental Management, MoEF	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Directorate of EIA, MoEF	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
B	Ministry of Energy and Natural Resources	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Turkish Committee of Air Quality and Control	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Manisa Environmental and Cultural Protection Foundation	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Ege Nature Protection Society	General	Invitation emailed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Chamber of Environmental Engineers, İzmir	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Protection of Natural Life Association	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Ege Region Industrial Organisation	General	Invitation emailed	31.10.2008	Y
F	Greenpeace	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Turkish Foundation for Combating Soil Erosion (TEMA) - URLA	Ayşen Kaya	Invitation emailed	31.10.2008	Y
F	WWF	General	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
D	Regional Environmental Centre	Yunus Arıkan	Invitation faxed	31.10.2008	Y
F	REEEP	General	Invitation emailed	04.11.2008	Y
	GS	General	Invitation emailed	04.11.2008	Y

A. 2. Invitation text

PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENT

Soma Wind Power Plant will be constructed by Bilgin Wind Power Plant Energy Generation Corporation.

Two separate meetings will be held in order to inform the residents and all stakeholders about the project and receive any comments.

First Meeting Date: 10.11.2008-Monday, Meeting Hour 10.30, Meeting Place: Gökçukur Village Coffee House

Second Meeting Date: 10.11.2008-Monday, Meeting Hour 15.30, Meeting Place: Hecizköy Village Coffee House



DUYURU

Bilgin Rüzgar Santrali Enerji Üretim Anonim Şirketi tarafından yapımı planlanan Soma Rüzgar Enerjisi Santrali ile ilgili tüm paydaşları yatırım hakkında bilgilendirmek, projeye ilişkin görüş ve önerileri almak amacıyla, iki ayrı yerde "Halkın Katılımı Toplantısı" yapılacaktır. Halkımıza duyurulur.

1.Toplantı
TARİH/SAAT: 10.11.2008-Pazartesi - 10:30
YER: Gökçukur Köyü Kiraathanesi"

2. Toplantı
TARİH/SAAT: 10.11.2008-Pazartesi - 15:30
YER: Hecizköy Kiraathanesi"

SECTION B. Meeting

B. 1. Agenda of the meeting

1. Opening of the meeting
 - Introducing of the project developers and the representative from the project owner company
 - Explanation of the objective of the meeting, climate change and emission reduction concepts and GS certification process
 - Explanation of how the emission reductions are calculated
2. Explanation of the project
 - Distribution of non-technical summaries to the attendees
 - Basic technical explanations included in the summary will be explained.
3. Questions about the project
 - Discussion about the project.
 - Possible impacts to the everyday life in the village will be clarified.
4. Blind Sustainable Development Matrix (SD) exercise

- Distribution of the matrixes and explanation of the parameters with examples
 - Assistance to fill down the forms
5. Discussion on monitoring SD
- If any negative marks were given, discussion for mitigation will be discussed
 - How the project could be improved to have more positive impacts in terms of SD
6. Closure of the meeting
- Information on how the feedback round will be carried on
 - Filling down of the evaluation forms

B. 2. Non-technical summary

Soma 90 MW WIND POWER PLANT

DESCRIPTION and OBJECTIVE of The PROJECT

Bilgin RES Enerji Üretim A.Ş. plans to built 36 wind turbines, each having a capacity of 2.5 MW in Kırkağaç and Soma Boroughs of Manisa. 12 of the turbines will be located in Kırkağaç on East of the province and 24 of them will be on West in Soma Borough. The project aims to supply a portion of country's electricity demand as well as to contribute Turkish economy. The total installed power will be 90 MW and the annual electricity generation is calculated as 360,120 MWh. The project will be accomplished in 32 months and the project life is expected to be 49 years.

SPECIFICATIONS of The PROJECT

The turbines will be located on the top of Davullu Hill, Karadede Hill, Ören Hill, Şifa Hill and will cover an area of 150 hectares. The site selection is based on detailed wind measurements, smoothness of the surface, availability of the topographical conditions for access and construction, the available area size and the distance to the national grid connection point.

The turbines will be imported from Europe. The towers will be manufactured preferably by local market, otherwise they will be imported. The wiring, transformers and electro-mechanic equipment will also preferably purchased from local producers, otherwise will be imported. The electricity generated in wind turbines will be transferred to switchgear through underground wiring and then will be passed to interconnection of national grid via 40 utility poles, each having 35m height, placed on the ground along 12 kms.

The projects will utilise wind power to generate electricity by transforming it to mechanical power. There is no establishment in the project site and switchgear area, social and administrative buildings will be constructed as a part of the project.

The wind power plant to be operated is not expected to cause any significant negative impact to the environment. Non-carcinogen lubricants will be used for the maintenance of transformers and the waste grease will collected in impermeable containers to be

transformed to recycling centre. In order to avoid the particulate matter emission during construction, the roads will be watered periodically, loading and unloading will be done carefully and the loaded trucks will be covered by hammock. The noise cause by the heavy machinery used for construction will be in a negligible level and will not disturb the neighbouring residential area. During operational phase, no emission will be released. The noise outside from the blades and inside from electricity motor and transformers will be negligible for the local residents.

Emission Reduction

The emission reduction done by the project is calculated with the methods used in the context of Clean Development Mechanism under United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. The project is determined to reduce 233,000 ton CO₂eq. each year

Those kinds of investments which do not emit any Greenhouse Gases are promoted in the framework of corporate social responsibility. The project should be certificated by internationally recognized standards to be eligible for the benefit of those promotions. Soma Wind Power Plant will be certificated by "Gold Standard". This will provide an additional income for the project and will contribute to raising the interest of investors to those projects as well as utilising local renewable energy resources for electricity generation.

B. 3. Participants

i. List of participants

Participant list stakeholder consultation-First Meeting			
Date and time: 10.11.2008, 10:30			
Location: Gökçukur Village			
Name participant, job/position in the community	Male/ Female	Organisation (if relevant)	Contact details
Pınar Öztürk, Project Manager	F	Pioneer Carbon	0312-439 95 03
Sami Akça, Biologist	M	Provincial Directorate of Manisa, Min. Env. & Forestry	0236-237 10 61
Gülcan Karaserçe, Associate Director	F	Provincial Directorate of Manisa, Min. Env. & Forestry	0236-237 10 61
Hülya Koçak, Chemical Eng.	F	Provincial Directorate of Manisa, Min. Env. & Forestry	0236-237 10 61
Mehmet Ünlü, Agricultural Eng.	M	Kırkağaç Agricultural Management, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs	0236-588 14 14
Mehmet Geniz, Farmer	M		
Halil Alan, Farmer	M	Gökçukur Village	0537-437 13 41

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Recep Çoban, Muhtar	M	Gökçukur Village	0536-460 13 65
Cafer Altıntaş, Muhtar	M	Hamidiye Village	0536-661 83 63
Muammer Nemli, Farmer	M	Gökçukur Village	0535-608 03 38
Aslı Özçelik, Gen. Man.	F	JPMCC	0312-439 95 03

Participant list stakeholder consultation-Second Meeting			
Date and time: 10.11.2008, 15:30			
Location: Hecizköy Village			
Name participant, job/position in the community	Male/Female	Organisation (if relevant)	Contact details
Pınar Öztürk, Project Manager	F	Pioneer Carbon	0312-439 95 03
İlyas Albez, Muhtar	M	-	-
Nurettin Karabörk, Env. Eng.	M	TKİ (Turkish Coal Enterprise)	0555-645 21 29 karabork@mynet.com
Sezgin Gümüşer, Map. Eng.	M	Special Provincial Administration	0542-486 36 64 sgumuser@hotmail.com
Eşref Vardar, Mech. Eng.	M	Bilgin Holding	0532-504 97 43
Mustafa Işık, Muhtar	M	Heciz Village	0532-705 74 54
Hülya Savcı, Env. Eng.	F	TKİ (Turkish Coal Institute)	0236-613 23 26
Yeliz Parmaksız, Env. Eng.	F	Soma Municipality	0236-613 65 05 0535-849 53 92
Şeref Öksum, Adm. Officer	M	TEİAŞ (Turkish Elec. Transmission Comp.), Env. Man.Board	0236-613 20 00
Öden Yapıcı, Head of the Env.Affairs Dep.	M	Soma Municipality	0236-613 65 05
Murat Gergin, Head of the Domestic services Dep.	M	Soma Municipality	0236-613 65 05
Dursun Kurt, Member of the board	M	TEİAŞ (Turkish Elec. Transmission Comp.), Env. Man.Board	0236-613 20 00
Muharrem Demir, Member of the board	M	TEİAŞ (Turkish Elec. Transmission Comp.), Env. Man.Board	0236-613 20 00
Burte Mor, Technician	M	Soma Directorate of Agriculture	burtemor@hotmail.com
M. Zafer Ülgen, Eng.	M	Soma Directorate of	zaferrulgen@hotmail.co

		Agriculture	m
Ergin Gündoğdu, Officer	M	TEİAŞ	0236-613 20 00
Mustafa Cılız, Director	M	Soma Directorate of Agriculture	-
Sedat Saygılı, Muhtar	M	Göktaş Village	0236-636 52 31
Aslı Özçelik, Manager	F	Pioneer Carbon	0312-439 95 03
Coşkun Çanakkale, Forestry Eng.	M	Some Forestry Management	0236-613 20 38

ii. Evaluation forms

Name	
What is your impression of the meeting?	Most of the participants were content with the meeting and the information given about the project. A few participants commented that visual presentation would have been better for understanding.
What do you like about the project?	-Electricity generation without environmental pollution and global warming effects. -Contribution to national economy -Available job opportunities for the villagers.
What do you not like about the project?	-It will take some time for livestock to get used to wind turbines.
Signature	

The villagers were worried about their livestock interacting with the turbines. It is explained that a security fence will be placed around each turbine unit to avoid any damage to animals. However; they said that it will take some time for the animals to get used to the turbines and requested reservoirs in order to remedy that impact on them. The project owner approached positively to that request.

B. 4. Pictures



B. 5. Outcome of consultation

i. Minutes of the meeting

Two separate Stakeholder Consultation Meetings for Soma Wind Power Plant have been held on 10. November. 2008. The former was held at 10:30 in Gökçukur Village and the latter was at 15:30 in Hecizköy Village.

Both meetings have followed the same agenda. The meeting has opened with the introducing the project partners. The impacts of climate change were described briefly and the emission reduction concept was clarified. Gold Standard procedures were also explained to the participants in order to explain the aim of the meeting.

Afterwards, the project is described shortly while the non-technical summaries were being distributed to the attendees. Foreseen environmental impacts which are noise pollution and particulate matter emission during construction and noise pollution during operation are mentioned. It is stated that necessary precautions, such as watering the roads, careful loading and unloading the trucks and covering the top of loaded trucks by hammock; will be taken to avoid dust during construction. It is also explained that the noise of heavy machinery was determined to be negligible during construction as well as the noise of turbines during operation.

When comments and questions were requested, the following questions have been raised in the first meeting:

Q1: How will the turbines be brought up to the hills?

The project owner clarified the renovations will be done on the roads to be able to transfer the turbines.

The villagers requested the rehabilitation of existing roads.

Q2: We have already limited area here. Will the turbines be surrounded by fences? May our livestock graze in the area when the turbines are in operation?

Each turbine will be surrounded by separate fences to avoid closing all the area. The animals still can graze between the turbines. Turbines will give no harm to them.

The villagers said that a period of time, not longer than a year, will be required for animals to get used to the turbines. In order to mitigate this, they requested micro reservoirs to be built upland.

The questions raised in the second meeting are as follows:

Q3: What will be the job opportunities for the local people?

There will be temporary job opportunities for local residents during construction period. For the permanent positions available during operational phase, priority will be given to the local residents as well.

Q4: What will be the size of excavation? Will there be a lot of dust during construction? Will there be any rehabilitation on roads for the machinery for construction?

The size of the excavation will be (20x20x3)1200m³ for basement of each turbine. There may be renovation works on the land as well. Necessary precautions like watering the roads, careful loading and unloading the material, covering the trucks with hammock, will be undertaken by the workers. The muck will be carried to the landfill area.

Q5: How will the fauna be affected by the turbines? We have heard that the bees may lose their sense of direction. What may be the other impacts? How will the natural habitats and environment change by the implementation of the project?

As part of the environmental process, the flora and the fauna of the region is studied and reported. No endemic species has been determined. As the habitats are continuous and complimentary through the area, no negative impacts are expected on terrestrial fauna. The effect on migrating birds is expected to be negligible as the vegetation on top of the hills is rare and the birds generally prefer the area around for breeding.(Reference :The Project Presentation Report submitted to the MoEF).

Q6: What precautions are taken for the risk of fire? Is it possible to build a reservoir nearby for fire fighting?

Although the fire risk is low in wind power plants, an emergency plan will be included in the environmental management plan. There is no reservoir planned to be built but this comment will be evaluated by the construction company.(The Health and Safety Management Plans of the project owner).

Q7: How many trees will be cut for the project?

The number of trees is not exact at the moment but the turbines will be placed on top of the hills where the trees are rare, therefore; the number is not expected to be high.

A fixed amount of fee determined by Forestry Management will be paid for each tree to be cut. The trees are sold by the Management. This amount of fund is used for rehabilitation of forests and new plantation.

Q8: What is the size of the area? What kind of precautions has been taken for human and animals entering the site?

The total area is about 150 hectares but the area will not be closed for other activities. Each turbine will be surrounded by separate fences to avoid humans and animals to enter in.

Q9: Have the noise pollution caused by the turbines been researched? How will be residential areas and animals affected by that level of noise?

The noise level has been researched and the results are submitted by the Project Presentation Report to the Ministry of Environment and Forestry. The nearest residential area to the project is 1 kilometre away and the noise level will not be disturbing the local people.

Q10: What are the electromagnetic effects of the turbines? Will the transmitters for radio and TV be affected?

The sources of low electromagnetic radiation are the electrical generator and medium voltage transformer in wind power plant. The wiring system will be underground between the turbines to keep the exposure to minimal. The electromagnetic field of a wind turbine is weak and effective only to short distances and at a height of 80ms. For this reason, no significant exposure is possible at ground level or away from the turbine.

With regard to interference with radio and TV transmitters, this effect was more of a problem with turbines with metal blades. The new generation blades are made of synthetic materials which have minimal effects on transmission of electromagnetic waves. (This information we have learned from the Turbine manufacturer that stated that the blades and the Turbine are manufactured to the EU standards and according to the the United Nation Environmental Programme (UNEP) DD for wind farm document . At pg 9 it says that "Fibreglass blades are partially transparent to electromagnetic waves, and therefore do not generally cause EMI problems.") Similar information is also provided on the EWEA website (European Wind Energy Association) and the following link to Wind-Energy-The Fact (coordinated by EWEA) <http://www.wind-energy-the-facts.org/es/environment/chapter-2-environmental-impacts/electromagnetic-fields-and-marine-organisms.html> summarizes issues related to EMI and this also supports our arguments as the blades are in compliance with EU Standards.

Q11: What about the aesthetic and visual effects of the turbines? Will there be any planning activities?

The wind turbines are generally perceived as picturesque by the local people in Turkey. They are perceived as sign of environmental friendly development. On the other hand, red lights will be placed on top of each turbine to be lightened up at dark hours for security reasons.

Q12: The lubricants used for the maintenance of turbines may cause water and soil pollution. How will they be disposed?

The lubricants will be collected in impermeable containers and be sent to the recycling centre. There is no risk of water or soil pollution. This is also clearly explained in the Project Presentation Report presented to the MoEF.

It is explained that the parameters in the matrix will be monitored continuously during the

project development and any further questions and comments; which may be raised after the meeting, are all welcomed to the project developers.

The meeting is closed by giving information how the feedback will be given. The villagers are requested to follow up the feedback by the minutes of meeting send to the muhtar. It is also indicated that the minutes will also be faxed to the governmental agencies and NGO as well.

ii. Assessment of comments

Stakeholder Comment	Assessment	Response to comment
Transportation of the turbines to the site	Negative	The necessary improvements and renovations will be made for the proper transportation of the turbine components.
Confinement of the grazing grounds	Negative	The stakeholders were ensured that there will not be massive consignments but the turbines will be secured by individual fencing.
Possibility for temporary and permanent jobs for the locals	Positive	During construction and operation stages of the project the necessary workforce will be recruited as far as possible from the local inhabitants, depending of the availability of the relevant skills.
Disturbance levels related to especially dust during the construction.	Negative	There will not be massive construction affairs but dust will be managed and controlled by regularly spraying the excavations and road construction sites.
Effect on Fauna	Negative	No negative impact is expected for the fauna as there will be no significant habitat destructions and fragmentations.
Risk of Fire	Negative	Minimal risk of fire due wind farm operation. However there will be an emergency action plan to be prepared for any kind of fire incidence.
Amount of Tree Cutting	Negative	Some trees will be cut to clear the access roads and turbine footing. The exact number or volume of the biomass that will be removed will be determined by the report of the local forestry headquarters' report. Accordingly there will be tree plantation to compensate the loss.
Noise pollution	Negative	Turbines will be located at a safe distance to avoid any noise disturbance and the noise levels are within the legally allowed limits.
Electro Magnetic effects of turbines and interference with TV and Radio	Negative	The wiring will be underground to eliminate any such problems. Also the EM field generated by the turbines are very low that can only have an effect at very close proximity therefore it is very unlikely to face a problem related to turbines.
Aesthetic and Visual aspects	Positive	Most of the wind turbines are considered as elegant and

		picturesque by most of the locals.
Lubricants may contaminate the land	Negative	The lubricants are going to be collected in impermeable containers and will be sent to the recycling facilities.
Can micro reservoirs be built to support the livestock	Positive	During construction such micro reservoirs can be built to help collect water precipitation during rainy days and save the water for dry times.
Can the roads be improved	Positive	During the construction stage the roads will be improved and renewed

iii. Revisit sustainability assessment

	Yes	No
Are you going to revisit the sustainable development assessment?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Give reasoning behind decision the decision.

The wind power plant is not perceived to harm the environment by the stakeholders. The concerns raised by the stakeholders are answered and therefore there is no need to revisit sustainability assessment.

iv. Summary of alterations based on comments

No alteration to the main aspects of the project has been offered by the stakeholders. However the following addition will be improving the sustainability aspects of the project:

- Micro reservoirs to be built upland for livestock. These reservoirs will be built during construction period.
- Rehabilitation of the existing roads These roads will be rehabilitated during construction period.
- Reservoir for risk of fire: Such a reservoir will be built during construction period.

SECTION C. Sustainable Development Matrix

C.1. Own sustainable development matrix

[See Toolkit 2.4.2 and Toolkit Annex I]

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
-----------	--------------------	----------------------------	----------------------------------	-------------------

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
Gold Standard indicators of sustainable development.	If relevant copy mitigation measure from "do no harm" – table, or include mitigation measure used to neutralise a score of ‘-‘	Check www.undp.or/mdg and www.mdgmonitor.org Describe how your indicator is related to local MDG goals	Defined by project developer	Negative impact: score ‘-‘ in case negative impact is not fully mitigated score 0 in case impact is planned to be fully mitigated No change in impact: score 0 Positive impact: score ‘+‘
Air quality	Dust during construction will be sprayed by water	Carbon dioxide emissions (per capita) and consumption of ozone depleting CFCs: CO ₂ emissions are the highest among the other Green House Gas (GHG) emissions. 10% increase in CO ₂ emissions per capita has been observed between 1995-2015.MDG 7 B	Electricity generation by the project will be monitored to see its GHG removal effect However the parameter is chosen to be zero since here, although there will be positive impact, there will not be a reduction in pollution at the immediate vicinity of the site (where there is a thermal power plant that will keep polluting atmosphere), so to be conservative, we are choosing 0.	0
Water quality and quantity	Water will be acquired via tankers and waste water will be kept in an isolated septic tank to be later discharged by a licensed transfer company	MDG 7 Ensure Environmental sustainability The water resource is utilized efficiently and the contamination of surface and underground sources are protected by complying with the regulations of the host country that integrated environmental sustainability to its regulations and policies.	Records of purchased water and records of waste water from septic tank (Baseline is the absence of a workers population that will utilize water and produce waste water) But since we are not improving water	0

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
			quality or quantity nor are we degrading its quality or reducing its quantity we take this indicator to be neutral.	
Soil condition	The trees which will be cut during construction phase will be remedied in coordination with local forestry management. There will be more trees planted than those removed during the construction phase.	MDG 7 Ensure environmental sustainability. Target 7.B Proportion of the land covered by the forest to be increased by 2010.	The report of the local forestry management office. (Baseline is The project area is covered by shrubs, maquis and low height oak trees.)	0
Other pollutants	Lubricants (from construction machines and wind turbines) will be discarded in accordance with national regulations.	MDG 7 Ensure environmental sustainability.	The amount of the oil will be recorded and a copy of the receipt will be filed when transferring to waste oil recycling facilities.	0
Biodiversity	If birds are observed to be harmed the facility will be equipped with bird deterrents.	MDG 7 Ensure environmental sustainability.	One hunter from each side of the project will be engaged to do dead bird searches during the migration season. (Observation during migration season can reveal baseline situation)	0

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
Quality of employment		MDG 1- Eradicate extreme poverty Target 1.B: Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people	Employee records (Baseline is the number of jobless in the village Average income of the village, based on what Muhtar will tell))	+
Livelihood of the poor		MDG 1- Eradicate extreme poverty Target 1.B: Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people	Employee payment rolls	+
Access to affordable and clean energy services		MDG 1- Eradicate extreme poverty Energy use per \$1 Gross Domestic Product: Total energy supply per \$1 GDP is below OECD average	National statistics on resource share in electricity generation and consumption per capita.	+
Human and institutional capacity		MDG 1- Eradicate extreme poverty Target 1.B: Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people	Employee records on training. (Baseline: Employed staff's background records at the date of start to the job.)	+
Quantitative employment and income generation		MDG 1- Eradicate extreme poverty Target 1.B: Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people	Employee records (Average income of the village inhabitants as told by the Muhtar.)	+
Balance of payments and investment			National reports on oil imports,	0

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
			yet the change may be insignificant.(The amount of fossil fuel imports at the date of decision to invest. Since the project will slightly displace imported fossil fuels.)	
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance			National statistics of newly added wind power projects.(The number and peculiarities of wind power projects at the time of decision for investment.)	+

Air Quality- No emissions which are harmful to human health or environment will be released by the project. In contrast, positive impact on air quality is expected as the project replaces same amount of electricity provided by the grid which is dominated by fossil fuel fired power plants. Along with CO₂, NO_x, SO₂, particulate matter emissions which would be released by thermal power plants for generation of same amount of electricity will be avoided.

The project will also contribute to the 7.B Millennium Development Goal of decreasing CO₂ emissions per capita.

Dust emissions during the construction will be controlled by spraying water by a hammock. This also complies with the host country regulations thus supports the MDG 7 Integration of sustainable development and environmental protection to the country policies and regulations

Water Quality and Quantity- No negative impacts on water quality are expected as any water resource, i.e. river, lake, reservoirs are not present within the project site, and no water resource would be utilized to realize the project.

During the construction and operation phases water for the daily needs of the personnel will be purchased from the village via tankers and the waste water will be temporarily stored in isolated septic tank to be transferred to the municipalities by licensed transfer companies.

During the maintenance of the turbines, non-carcinogen lubricants will be used and the waste

grease will be collected in impermeable containers to be transformed to recycling centre in accordance with the Hazardous Waste Control Regulations and Waste Oil Control Regulations.

Furthermore, micro reservoirs which will be built for livestock and fire fighting will contribute to the water quantity in the region.

Soil Condition- Majority of the project site is covered by maquis (local tree) forest but the top of the hills where turbines will be located are relatively bare. The trees which will be cut for road construction will be remedied in coordination with local forestry management.

No residuals which may affect the soil quality will be released during operation. As explained above, lubricants will be carefully handled. Solid waste will be deposited and transferred to landfill site.

The land will still be available for other purposes such as grazing and agriculture.

Other Pollutants- Necessary precautions for accidents and malfunction of the plant will be taken by the project owner. An emergency plan is developed and the employees will be trained for possible emergency cases.

Biodiversity- No significant impact on flora or fauna is expected. There are fauna species under conservation living in the region as defined by the literature. However; the project will not cause any habitat fragmentations for terrestrial fauna species and will not give any irreversible harm to living conditions of those species. If any found, necessary precautions will be taken for those species under conservation in accordance with the international agreements (Bern Convention) and national laws by the Ministry Of Env. Forest.

The region is also located on the migration route of the birds. However; migrating birds will not be adversely affected due to the facts that the turbines will change the air current and the noise of turbines will disturb them. On the other hand, the nesting places are inside the forest where vegetation is dense rather than the top of hills where turbines will be located. The potential impact to bird life will be monitored by engaging one villager for each part of the project to inspect and search for dead bird bodies during migration seasons.

Quality of the employment- Temporary jobs during construction will be available for local people. The priority for permanent position during operation will be given to the local residents, as many as possible; who can meet required specifications.

Livelihood of the poor- The project will create permanent job opportunities for local people during operation and therefore household income for the residents.

Rehabilitation of the existing roads will also contribute to livelihood of the poor by easing the access to the village particularly on winter time.

This indicator is in harmony with the MDG 1 which is also an emphasized MDG for Turkey.

Access to affordable and clean energy services- As the local natural resources are utilised for energy production; the dependency on imported fossil fuel will be lowered. This will also contribute the Millennium Development Goal 7B of increasing the energy supply per \$1 as well.

Human and institutional capacity- The workers will be trained for health and safety issues

during construction. The technicians will also be trained by the turbine manufacturers and by TEIAS for the regular performance of the plant as required by the regulations.

Quantitative employment and income generation- Workers will be hired during construction phase (approximately 60 workers) and permanent jobs will be available in operational phase (approximately 15 personnel).

Balance of payments and investment- No impacts on balance of payments are foreseen. Although the plant lowers the dependency on imported fossil fuel, the impact would be too small to be monitored.

Technology transfer and technological self-reliance – The project will encourage the investments on wind power sector and will promote the capacity enhancement. The turbines are exported from Europe for the project. However; attempts of local manufacturers to produce wind turbines have been announced recently.

In addition, the project owner will subcontract the works to local firms and by the way the project will contribute to their capacity development for renewable energy projects as well.

C.2. Outcome Blind sustainable development exercise

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Chosen parameter and explanation	Score given by stakeholders
Gold Standard indicators of sustainable development.	If relevant copy mitigation measure from "do no harm" – table, or include mitigation measure used to neutralise a score of ‘-’	Defined by project developer	Negative impact: score ‘-’ in case negative impact is not fully mitigated score 0 in case impact is planned to be fully mitigated No change in impact: score 0 Positive impact: score ‘+’
Air quality	Necessary precautions should be taken in order to avoid dust during construction.	Visual inspection of the dust related to construction. Muhtar of the relevant villages will be asked to keep an eye on the situation and will be asked to report if the project owner does not take the necessary measures for dust control.	+
Water quality and quantity	No River or ground water will be used. Water will be supplied by a tanker from the well the village uses, the quantity of the water that will be used is insignificant to impact the local well as most of the workers will be from the existing population of the village. The waste water will be stored in a sealed septic and be transferred to the treatment facility of the Municipality.	Quantity –Litters of waters used during construction and operation of the planned to be recorded in a log book. Quality-The discharge water quantity and its transfer to the municipality facilities to be logged and the relevant papers kept in a file.	0
Soil condition	The lubricants used during construction and operation shall be considered hazardous waste and will be disposed in accordance with the regulations.	A copy of the hazardous material disposal forms will be kept and lubricant changes will be logged in a book.	-
Other pollutants	Noise pollution should be considered.	Baseline noise will be measured by an audiometer and noise will be measured once during the construction stage	-

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		and seasonally during the operational stage to make sure it is within the regulated limits.	
Biodiversity	Fauna and flora may be affected during the construction phase. Bird migration could be affected.	One villager from each part of the project (a hunter) will be assigned to make observations during the migration and dead bird search during the operation.	-
Quality of employment	Health and safety issues should be considered.	Health and safety officer will log the accidents and maintain the healthy and safe working environment via a an H&S Plan	+
Livelihood of the poor	Job opportunities will be available for the villagers during construction phase but they are limited.	The copies of the social security records of the workers will be filed.	0
Access to affordable and clean energy services	Renewable resources will be utilised for electricity generation for 49 years.	Amount of electricity produced	+
Human and institutional capacity	Workers will be trained for H&S issues and other issues relevant to operation	Attendance sheet s and certification papers which ever is appropriate.	0
Quantitative employment and income generation	During the construction there will be temporary employment and during the operation there will be some permanent employments	Social security and employee records	+
Balance of payments and investment	Turkey's dependency to imported fossil fuel for electricity production will be slightly reduced	Produced electricity and SPO reports	0
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance		The electromechanis technicians and engineers trained by the Nordex turbine company will improve their expertise in the sector. Basic design and construction companies learn and get experienced in	+

		<p>the areas specific to wind farm industry. Since the number of installed turbines will increase by the help of this project the turbine company is planning to set up a maintenance hub in Turkey leading to transfer of know how via the local personnel they will be recruiting. Training records and related agreements can be the parameter to monitor these effects.</p>	
--	--	---	--

Air quality- The mitigation measures for dust formed during construction have been defined and explained as watering the roads, careful loading and unloading the trucks and covering the top of loaded trucks by hammock. The estimated concentration of particulate matter is lower than the limits allowed by the regulations.

Soil condition- The concerns about lubricants and solid waste have already been considered in the original SD matrix.

Other pollutants- Noise pollution caused by the project has been determined to be at a level which would not disturb the local residents by pre-environmental impact studies.

In addition, ear plugs will be distributed to workers and the personnel to keep the noise level at minimal during construction and operation.

Biodiversity- The impact of the wind turbines will be minimal as explained in the original SD matrix. The trees cut for road construction will be remedied and vegetation cover is rare on the top of hills. The fauna may adversely be affected during the construction phase and may relocate away from the turbines in the forest. Migrating birds, on the other hand, will change their way away from turbines due to the changes in air current and noise caused by turbines.

Quality of employment- Training will be given for health and safety to the workers.

Livelihood of the poor- Although the job opportunities are limited, the project will create considerable household incomes if the number of available positions is compared to the limited labour force in the village.

Give analysis of difference between own sustainable development table and the one resulting from the blind exercise with stakeholders. Explain way of consolidation.

The comments on air quality and noise pollution have been considered in Environmental Management Plan as indicated in the project presentation report submitted to Ministry of Environment and Forest. The project is assessed positively by the Ministry and an EIA-exemption letter is issued. The project may be abandoned or the project owners may be fined if any disturbances which have not been considered in the report are determined.

Therefore, the score for air quality is kept as positive considering that necessary precautions will be taken during construction which will last in 16 months. The noise pollution is also calculated as to be at a minimum level which would not disturb the local residents of nearby villages.

C.3. Consolidated sustainable development matrix

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Final score
Gold Standard indicators of sustainable development.	If relevant copy mitigation measure from "do no harm" – table, or include mitigation measure used to neutralise a score of ‘-’	Check www.undp.or/mdg and www.mdgmonitor.org Describe how your indicator is related to local MDG goals	Defined by project developer	Negative impact: score ‘-’ in case negative impact is not fully mitigated score 0 in case impact is planned to be fully mitigated No change in impact: score 0 Positive impact: score ‘+’
Air quality		Carbon dioxide emissions (per capita) and consumption of ozone depleting CFCs: CO ₂ emissions are the highest among the other Green House Gas (GHG) emissions. 10% increase in CO ₂ emissions per capita has been observed between 1995-2003.	Electricity generation by the project and its comparison to grid’s GHG emission factor.	+
Water quality and quantity			Record of water utilized and discharged (transfer records of the septic tank).	0
Soil condition	The trees which will be cut during construction phase will be remedied in coordination with local forestry management.		Environmental management plan and the amount of biomass that will be removed will be the baseline Area that will be replanted will be monitored by visual inspection annually.	0
Other pollutants	Lubricants to be removed according to H&S plan and		Records of the Lubricant removal and	0

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	SOP. Transported to the heavy oil recycle facility		transportation to recycling facility forms.	
Biodiversity			Dead body search reports by one hunter from each part of the project.	0
Quality of employment			Employee records	+
Livelihood of the poor			Employee payment rolls	+
Access to affordable and clean energy services		Energy use per \$1 Gross Domestic Product: Total energy supply per \$1 GDP is below OECD average	National statistics on resource share in electricity generation and consumption per capita.	+
Human and institutional capacity			Employee records on training.	+
Quantitative employment and income generation			Employee records	+
Balance of payments and investment				0
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance			National statistics of newly added wind power projects.	+
Justification choices, data source and provision of references				
Air quality	The metered electricity generation by the project will be recorded and multiplied by the carbon factor of the national grid to determine amount of GHG reduced.			
Water quality and quantity	Environmental Management Plan, water will be supplied by tankers to the site and will be collected in septic tanks which will be emptied regularly and discharged in accordance with Water Pollution Control Regulations. The waste oil will be collected and transferred to recycling centre in accordance with the Hazardous Waste Control Regulations and Waste Oil Control Regulations. All these be recorded on a log book and relevant forms will be filed.			
Soil condition	Environmental Management Plan, implemented in coordination with Forestry Management. Local forestry management authority will prepare a report to indicate the amount of trees, scrubs (biomass) removed during the construction of access roads and turbine bases. The necessary amount of trees to compensate this biomass will be planted to a place that will be determined by the			

Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	local forestry authority and the plantations will be observed annually, by visual inspection.
Other pollutants	Environmental Management Plan, Solid Waste Management plan and Emergency Plans. The records of the lubricant discharge and transportation will be logged and filed.
Biodiversity	The project has EIA-exemption letter from Ministry of Environment and Forest. Necessary precautions will be taken for the species under conservation by international conventions. One hunter will be engaged from each village and during the operational stage of the wind farm they will walk near the turbines and search for the dead bird and bats. They will report any dead animals to the wind farm management, to be recorded in a logbook.
Quality of employment	Employee records gathered from the project owner including start and end dates. For construction; engineers, site officers, foremen and workers will be hired. During operation, engineers, administrative officers, operators and security will be employed.
Livelihood of the poor	Social Security records of the employees.
Access to affordable and clean energy services	Turkish Electricity Transmission Company (TEİAŞ) * Annual development of Turkey's gross electricity generation by share of primary energy resources *Annual development of installed capacity, gross generation, supply and net consumption in Turkey
Human and institutional capacity	Employee records on training.
Quantitative employment and income generation	Employee records gathered from the project owner including their addresses.
Balance of payments and investment	
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance	Electricity Market Regulating Authority (EPDK) The development of wind power plants in Turkey



SECTION D. Preparation of Stakeholder Feedback Round

The muhtars, as representatives for villagers, will be kept informed about the revisions by phone calls.

The other stakeholders attended to meeting will be informed by faxing the report and the summary of PDD. Other comments will be invited through the publication of PDD on web page.



Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Annex 1: Participant list

SOMA RÜZGAR ENERJİSİ SANTRALİ HALKIN KATILIMI TOPLANTISI
10.KASIM.2008- PAZARTESİ
KATILIMCI LİSTESİ ~ 1. Toplantı

Ad, Soyad	Meslek	Bayan/Erkek (B/E belirtiniz)	Kurum/ Kuruluş	Tel./email	İmza
Pınar ÖZTÜRK	Proje Yön.	B	Pioneer Carbon	08124399503	
Sami AKGA	psiyolog	E	Manisa İl Çevre ve Orman Müd.	0236 237 10 61	
Gülcan KARASEKİ	şube müd.	B	"	"	
Hulya KOĞAL	kimya Müh.	B	"	"	
Mehmet Usta	Ziraat Müh.	E	İlçe Tarım Müdürlüğü Kilicler	0236 5881414	
Mehmet Benli	Çiftçi				
Halil Alan	Çiftçi	E	Gökcuğur köyü	0537 4371341	
Rıcep Çoban	Muhtar	E	Gökcuğurköyü	0536 460 1265	
Cater Altıntaş	Muhtar	E	Hamiyeye köy. muh	0536661 8363	
Muammer Memli	Çiftçi		Gökcuğur köyü	0535 60 80338	
Aslı Özcelik	Gn. Md.	B	JPMCC	(312) 4399503	



Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

SOMA RÜZGAR ENERJİSİ SANTRALİ HALKIN KATILIMI TOPLANTISI
10.KASIM.2008- PAZARTESİ
KATILIMCI LİSTESİ - 2.Toplantı

Ad, Soyad	Meslek	Bayan/Erkek (B/E belirtiniz)	Kurum/ Kuruluş	Tel./email	İmza
Pınar ÖZTÜRK	Proje Yön.	E	Pioneer Carbon	03124399508	
İlyas Albez	Muhtas	F			
Nurattin KARABÖK	Çevre Müh.	E	TKİ ELİ.	5556452179 karabok@npppt.com	
Sezgin GÜMÜŞER	Harita Müh.	E	İl Özel İdare	5424863664 sgumus@hokmak.com	
Ercan VARDAR	Makina Tek.	E	Bilgi Holding.	05325049773	
Mustafa İŞİK	Muhtas	E	Heçiz Köyü	05227057050	
Hülya SAULI	Çevre Mühendisi	B	E.L.i	9.236 6132326	
Jalız PARMAKSIZ	Çevre Müh.	B	Soma Belediyesi Çevre Komisyonu	236 6136505 5358495392	
Öden ÖKSÜM	İden Şef	E	TEİAŞ Çevre Şefi	6132000	
Öden TAPICI	Soma Bel. Çev. Kor. Müd.	F	Soma Belediyesi Çevre Kor. Müd.	6136505	
Marat GERGİN	Soma Bel. Tem. İst. Müd.	E	Soma Belediyesi Tem. İst. Müd.	6136505	
Dursun KURT	Soma Çevre Yatırım Kurumu	E	TEİAŞ Çevre	6132000	
Ulukarım DEMİR	Soma Çevre Yatırım Kurumu	E	TEİAŞ	6132000	



Annex 2: Feedback forms

Adınız ve Soyadınız	Jalız PARMAKSIZ
Toplantı ile ilgili görüşleriniz nelerdir?	Proje alanının tam olarak tanıtılmaması tanıtılmaması gibi nedenlerle eksiklikler vardı.
Proje ile ilgili en çok neyi beğendiniz?	Yenilenebilir enerji kaynağının kullanılmasını, Adımlar (olduğumuz), aksik kalan yolların doru-cevap ile cevaplarak yeterli bilgilerin alınabilmesi
Proje ile ilgili beğenmediğiniz hususlar nelerdir?	Görsel açıdan gibi nedenlerle akıllı tanıtılması aksik geldi.
İmzanız	

Adınız ve Soyadınız	
Toplantı ile ilgili görüşleriniz nelerdir?	Toplantı mekanı yetersiz. proje tanıtımı görsel olmalı. (Katılımcıların açısından)
Proje ile ilgili en çok neyi beğendiniz?	Karbon piyasasından permi alınarak bu tür yatırımların ülkemiz için desteklenmesi.
Proje ile ilgili beğenmediğiniz hususlar nelerdir?	Tüm genel tedbirler alınarak işletildiğinde proje desteklemekte ve yaygınlaştırılması talep etmekteyiz.
İmzanız	10.11.2008



Adınız ve Soyadınız	Nurettin KARABÖRK
Toplantı ile ilgili görüşleriniz nelerdir?	Proje ile ilgili halkın bilinçlendirilmesi dır.
Proje ile ilgili en çok neyi beğendiniz?	Yenilenebilir ve temiz enerji elde eden yatırıma yapılması dır.
Proje ile ilgili beğenmediğiniz hususlar nelerdir?	Yok
İmzanız	

Adınız ve Soyadınız	Burte MOR / İlçe Tarım Müd. Soma
Toplantı ile ilgili görüşleriniz nelerdir?	Yeterli katkılar
Proje ile ilgili en çok neyi beğendiniz?	Temiz Enerji
Proje ile ilgili beğenmediğiniz hususlar nelerdir?	Bir kısım Orman / Yeşil Alan yok olması
İmzanız	